

博士論文の要旨および 論文審査結果の要旨

氏名	Hooi, Lai Wan
学位の種類	博士（経営学）
学位記番号	経営博乙第5号
学位授与の日付	2010年3月17日
学位授与の要件	学位規則第4条第2項該当
学位論文題目	HUMAN CAPITAL MANAGEMENT PRACTICES IN MALAYSIA: LOCAL & FOREIGN PERSPECTIVES
論文審査委員	主査 正亀 芳造 教授 副査 片岡 信之 教授 副査 三宅 亨 教授 副査 村上 伸一 教授

<学位申請論文要旨>

HUMAN CAPITAL MANAGEMENT PRACTICES IN MALAYSIA: LOCAL AND FOREIGN PERSPECTIVES

Hooi, Lai Wan

Introduction

The purpose of the book is to trace the trends in human capital management (HCM) practices in the manufacturing sector in Malaysia. The focus is on four main areas of HCM, which is believed to have a significant impact on the competitiveness of the industry, namely, recruitment, compensation and benefits, promotion, and human capital development (HCD). In line with the advancement of technology and globalization, two studies were carried out to observe HCM practices of the past and present. These studies, which used samples from Malaysian based Japanese and Western multinational companies (MNCs), in addition to Malaysian local firms, is deemed important due to the magnitude of these MNCs' impacts on the Malaysian economy. The study was done on the manufacturing industry as it contributes significantly to the gross domestic product of the country as compared to other industries.

Research background

In an attempt to trace the trend in HCM practices in the manufacturing sector, the first study looks at HCM policies that have been in practice for the last two decades since the launching of the Look East Policy (LEP)

in December 1981. As the LEP was considering HCM policies that have contributed to Japan's phenomenal economic growth, this study focuses on HCM practices during the 1980s and early 1990s. It attempts to discuss the four areas of research by making a comparative analysis of the HCM practices in the manufacturing companies in Malaysia with that of Japanese HCM practices. It has been more than 20 years since the introduction of the LEP and many have gone for training and further studies in Japan. With the increasing number of Japanese interests in the companies in Malaysia, to what extent then have Japanese-style management model been successfully transported to Malaysia?

Based on the findings of the first study, a second study was conducted to analyze the current HCM practices in the manufacturing sector in Malaysia. If Japanese-affiliated companies in Malaysia have not adopted Japanese HCM practices of the parent company, what HCM practices then are implemented in the companies in Malaysia? Also, what then are the HCM practices of locally and foreign owned manufacturing firms in Malaysia if they have not adopted Japanese HCM practices despite the LEP? This study explores the efforts of a sample of MNCs that are gearing up for changes brought about by globalization and technological advancement by developing strategic HCM practices to entice the best candidates worldwide. Specifically, four MNCs in the chemical industry, which were selected based on equity ownership, were analyzed to ascertain if HCM practices in these MNCs in Malaysia are being aligned with global trends by providing an account of the HCM practices in these four MNCs. In addition to identifying the relevant HCM practices, commentary is provided of current knowledge in terms of best HCM practices that could be emulated by local organizations as well as other institutions in the Asia Pacific region. A salient focus of the study is to assess if globalized foreign owned MNCs are more likely to align their HCM practices with global trends rather than with the practices employed by locally owned MNCs. To understand if current HCM practices are indeed best practices in the industry, the study attempts to analyze the effect of current HCM practices on the satisfaction of the

employees. Are employees in foreign owned MNCs more satisfied with the current HCM policies rather than with the practices employed by locally owned MNCs? The chemical industry was selected for this study to understand what drives employees to stay on in these companies despite the perilous nature of the job.

Objectives of the study

In Malaysia, literature review reveals numerous case studies involving general comparisons of HCM activities that are rather superficial (Abdullah, 2001; Sheppard, 2001; Yong, 2003). In this study, the purpose is to trace the trends in HCM practices in the manufacturing sector in Malaysia. The study was done on the manufacturing industry as it contributes significantly to the gross domestic product of the country as compared to other industries.

In a nutshell, the objectives of this study are to:

- (a) analyze the HCM practices of manufacturing companies in Malaysia for the last two decades by making a comparative analysis with HCM practices in Japan to see if companies in Malaysia have emulated Japanese practices as advocated by the LEP
- (b) analyze the current HCM practices of the multinational manufacturing companies in Malaysia and their alignment with global HCM trends
- (c) analyze if globalized foreign owned MNCs are more likely to align their HCM policies with global trends rather than with the practices employed by locally owned MNCs
- (d) analyze the effect of current HCM practices on the satisfaction of the employees

Scope of the study

Chapter 1 introduces the research topic and outlines the areas of research. The objectives, hypotheses and methodology for the research are clearly stated and lay the groundwork for this study. The importance of studying the manufacturing sector and the significance of the study are also highlighted.

Chapter 2 focuses on the literature review of HCM practices for the first study. Conventional Japanese HCM practices were analyzed to understand what the Malaysian government hopes to achieve under the LEP. The chapter also discusses the transferability of conventional Japanese HCM practices to Malaysia and other countries. The chapter concludes with a brief discussion on the current literature on HCM practices in Malaysia.

Chapter 3 gives a review of the impact of HCM practices on employee satisfaction. Determinants of employee satisfaction based on the findings of past research show that employee satisfaction is affected by an array of HCM practices. Having discussed this, an attempt is made to discuss the impact of HCM practices on employee satisfaction. The focus of this chapter is to understand factors that affect employee satisfaction, particularly HCM practices. It lays the groundwork for the second study as well as help HC practitioners to understand and identify the best HCM practices that enhance employee satisfaction.

Chapter 4 outlines the current global trends in HCM – global trends in recruitment, compensation and human capital development (HCD). This chapter acts as a guide for human capital practitioners to understand some of the current HCM practices of leading companies worldwide. This analysis is designed to help human capital professionals within large enterprises to understand current global trends in recruitment, compensation and HCD practices and identify best practices that can be applied in their organizations in order to attain employer of choice status.

Chapter 5 first discusses the recruitment practices based on the data collected from the first study. It would reveal if these companies have adopted Japanese recruitment practices as well as expose the recruitment practices introduced in these companies. Having understood if Japanese recruitment practices have been adopted, the discussion focuses on the

current recruitment practices of a sample of MNCs in the manufacturing sector in Malaysia. This is analyzed in line with the current global trends in recruitment to observe if companies in Malaysia have responded to the rapid changes in the new millennium. This is followed by an analysis of the effects of the current recruitment practices on employee satisfaction. This chapter concludes with a discussion on the implications of the study for human capital practitioners in Malaysia.

Chapter 6 begins with a comparison of the remuneration practices in Japan and Malaysia based on the data collected from the first study. It would reveal if Japanese remuneration practices are applicable as well as give an insight of the remuneration practices introduced in these companies. The chapter next focuses on the current remuneration practices of the four MNCs and analyzes if MNCs in Malaysia have adopted some current global remuneration trends. Finally, the effects of the current remuneration practices on employee satisfaction will be discussed followed by a discussion on the implications of the study for human capital practitioners in Malaysia.

Chapter 7 analyzes if Japanese elements of promotion practices are found in Malaysian enterprises irrespective of whether there are Japanese interests in the companies. The rationale for analyzing Japanese promotion practices is that as promotion practices in Japanese management have to some extent enhance retention of workers as well as curb conflict among staff in career advancement, more Malaysian enterprises may adopt Japanese promotion practices as job hopping is quite common among local employees. The chapter then focuses on the current promotion practices of the companies in Malaysia if Malaysian enterprises have not adopted Japanese promotion practices. This chapter attempts to analyze promotion practices that would enhance employee satisfaction.

Chapter 8 analyzes the degree of Japanese HCD practices introduced and practiced in Malaysian companies since the implementation of the LEP.

It further focuses on the HCD practices and programs that are practiced by four MNCs operating in Malaysia. This will give an insight of the HCD practices of the companies in Malaysia if Japanese HCD practices were not significant in Malaysian enterprises. The study is designed to help human capital professionals within large enterprises to understand best practices in HCD that can be applied in their organizations to enhance employees' satisfaction.

Chapter 9 summarizes the whole study. The chapter outlines the discussions and conclusions of the research and discusses the future of HCM in Malaysia. The future of government policies pertaining to HCM, recommendations and proposals for future research are discussed. Towards the end of the chapter, an overall conclusion summarizes the whole study on HCM practices in Malaysia.

Characteristics of the study

There are three main characteristics that emerged from the study. First, is the limited applicability of Japanese style HCM practices at the Malaysian workplace. Despite Looking East for more than two decades, the adoption of Japanese HCM practices by the manufacturing companies in Malaysia is not significant. There is not a single model of Japanese HCM in the companies surveyed though some traits similar to Japanese HCM are visible. Rather, most of the companies practice a hybrid style of management incorporating western, oriental, and indigenous management techniques. Japanese subsidiaries in Malaysia adopt a combination of HCM practices; those of parent firms as well as the local British or American oriented HCM practices in Malaysia. Due to cultural differences, the Japanese style of management though desirable in some aspects may not be suitable for the Malaysian workplace. While Japanese style HCM and Western style HCM can now coexist in Malaysia, in the long run, the strong possibility of the creation of a Malaysian style HCM exists.

Second, in the era of globalization and IT explosion, companies in

Malaysia have advanced positively in adopting current global HCM practices. The results show that though the companies have adopted some global trends in HCM, intensity varies from company to company. Foreign owned MNCs are not more likely than locally owned MNCs to align their HCM practices with global trends. Foreign owned MNCs do not necessarily have better HCM practices even though these companies are more globalized in nature. Though all four companies are located in the same industrial area and are about the same size, the HCM policies of some of the companies are more attractive than others. The practices are rather similar, but the differences that exist have an impact on employees' satisfaction.

Third, employees' satisfaction in foreign owned MNCs is not necessarily higher than those in locally owned MNCs. No fixed pattern could be identified and the satisfaction level of the employees is very much dependent on what the company can offer regardless of ownership. Employees in the locally owned MNC seem more satisfied with the recruitment practices while employees in foreign owned MNCs are more satisfied with the remuneration and reward policies of the company. As for promotion practices, none of the employees in the locally owned MNC is very dissatisfied. As far as human capital development is concerned, employees in Japanese owned companies seem least satisfied. Respondents in all the companies seem most satisfied with the recruitment practices, followed by HCD practices, promotion practices and lastly compensation practices. Overall, the respondents' level of satisfaction with the HCM practices and morale level is moderate.

The purpose of this book is to provide a current understanding of developments in the field of human capital management. In short, this book is intended to be of value to human capital practitioners; to draw attention to those many aspects of human capital management which ought to receive attention, but which often do not do so in practice. With the continuing global changes in the new millennium, it is hoped that this book will make some small contribution to greater efficiency at the

workplace. The book is a product of careful planning and constant reviews of the currents of change.

Significance of the study

The main justification of the study is to contribute to the knowledge in the area, to the policy considerations and to the practitioners. By carrying out the two studies, it is hoped that those who are interested in HCM would have a better understanding of the HCM practices that are being implemented in the manufacturing companies. The first study will confirm the practicability and transferability of Japanese HCM practices not only to Malaysian companies, but also to other companies in general. The Malaysian government and HC practitioners will also understand the degree of success of the LEP as far as HCM is concerned. Policy changes may be necessary in line with the findings and similar findings of other researchers. Besides, HC practitioners could use the outcomes of the study to formulate policies that are appropriate for their companies. A better understanding of the feasibility of introducing Japanese HCM practices to the manufacturing companies in Malaysia is expected. It would also help policymakers decide if there is really a need to continue Looking East.

As for the second study, contributions would be to the current global trends in HCM. Outcomes of the study would draw attention to the current HCM practices in both the locally and foreign owned MNCs in Malaysia. It would provide an understanding of whether MNCs in Malaysia have implemented global HCM practices. In general, what constitutes global HCM practices would be highlighted. Besides, HC practitioners would have a better picture of HCM practices that affect employee satisfaction, and hence, employee efficiency. This would be an added knowledge for HC practitioners when it comes to designing HCM policies for the organization. With a better understanding of what makes employees tick, HCM practices that align the needs of the employees with the objectives of the company could be formulated. An insight of current global trends would also help HC practitioners consider the best practices

in HCM that would enhance employee satisfaction and performance.

In general, HC practitioners in the companies under study as well as other companies could use the findings of this study to reengineer the HCM policies of their organizations to craft a win-win strategy for both the company and the employees. A comparison of the past HCM practices with the current practices would help HC practitioners formulate best practices for their organization. It is imperative that HC practitioners formulate not only flexible HCM policies, but also policies that enhance employee satisfaction as well as company competitiveness. By tracing the trends in HCM, one would have a better insight of what is best for the organization.

Methodology

Subjects or data sources

For the first analysis, research on auto manufacturing companies was carried out. The auto manufacturing industry was chosen over other manufacturing industries, as it is a growing industry, and most of these companies have Japanese interests. As Japan is a major auto manufacturing country, a comparative analysis of HCM practices would be incomplete without analyzing the auto manufacturing industry. Here a comparative analysis was made between a Japanese auto manufacturing company and three other local auto manufacturing companies (set up before the LEP) – two with Japanese interests and one fully Malaysian owned, namely, Asa Motor Corporation, Jati Motor Corporation, Fujima Motor Corporation and Mayo Motor Corporation. As for the second analysis, four manufacturing companies - a manufacturer and supplier of a variety of chemical products; a manufacturer and supplier of a variety of household electrical items; a manufacturer and supplier of electronic components; a manufacturer of industrial alcohol and ester were used. The fictitious names of Ise Corporation, Kent Corporation, Sanma Corporation and AMas Corporation were given to the enterprises concerned. These companies especially in electrical and chemical manufacturing sprang up after the

launching of the LEP. It was during this period that Malaysia gradually moved from an agricultural based country to a manufacturing country. Emulating the East especially with Japan in mind, this part of the analysis attempts to show that the transfer of HCM practices to these companies would be more intense as compared to the auto manufacturing companies, which were mostly established before the introduction of the LEP. Ownership of the above organizations is summarized in the Table 1 below.

Table 1 Ownership of Companies

Name of Organization	Ownership
Asa Motor Corporation	100% Japanese
Jati Motor Corporation	100% Malaysian
Fujima Motor Corporation	Malaysian owned with some Japanese interests
Mayo Motor Corporation	Malaysian owned with some Japanese interests
Ise Corporation	100% Japanese
Kent Corporation	100% American
Sanma Corporation	Malaysian owned with some Japanese interests
AMas Corporation	Joint venture between Malaysia and America

For the second study, case study analysis was carried out in four leading chemical and petrochemical MNCs that were located in a common industrial area in Malaysia. The chemical and petrochemical industry was selected for this research to understand what drives employees to stay with these companies despite the perilous nature of the job. Workers are not only exposed to the physical hazards at the workplace, but also the chemical pollutants in the air. The four companies were identified based on the equity ownership to see if different ownership has an impact on the HCM policies of the company. The study was conducted in the natural environment of the organizations with minimum interference by the researcher. The four companies for the study are given the fictitious names of Gema Corporation, Hiro Corporation, EChem Corporation, and Johan Corporation. Gema Corporation is one of Malaysia's largest and leading chemical companies. It is a joint venture between a foreign owned chemical company and Malaysia's state owned petroleum corporation.

Hiro Corporation manufactures various products including chemicals and EChem Corporation is one of the largest integrated oil, gas solar and petrochemical companies in the world. Johan Corporation is Malaysia's state owned petroleum with subsidiaries in 32 countries. Ownership of the above organizations is summarized in Table 2 below.

Table 2 Ownership of Companies

Name of Organization	Ownership
Gema Corporation	Malaysian-European joint venture
Hiro Corporation	100% Japanese
EChem Corporation	100% European
Johan Corporation	100% Malaysian

Research design and procedure

The study began with observations and interviews with various people to have a better understanding of the phenomena before a literature review of books, as well as articles in journals related to the research topic was carried out. Company records, newspaper articles, handbooks and magazines were other sources of secondary data. Searching the World Wide Web for information on the Internet also served as a source for secondary data. Secondary data gathered through a literature review and opinions of various writers on issues relating to HCM policies gave an in-depth understanding of the study. Primary data were collected from questionnaire surveys and face to face in-depth interviews with the staff of the HC Department. Prior to finalizing the survey questionnaires, a pilot survey was conducted to test whether the questions are ambiguous to the respondents. The questionnaires for the survey were carefully designed to avoid infringement into areas that may be considered unethical. Follow up discussions were carried out electronically through e-mails, facsimile and telephone. The study was conducted in such a way that respondents did not suffer discomfort, embarrassment, or loss of privacy. The research ethics consideration of this study was demonstrated by ensuring the strictest confidentiality to the research participants. Employees who would be interviewed were informed in

advance to eliminate the element of unpleasant surprise. Thus, respondents had given their informed consent before participating in the research. A brief description of the purpose and benefits of the study were discussed with the respondents before the interview.

The study design had five steps. The first step was to obtain permission to carry out the research from the MD or CEO of the companies. A written letter was sent and faxed to the companies outlining the objectives of the research. After approval from the company, the next step was to contact the HC Department of each of the companies by telephone. In the third step, a meeting with the HC Directors was arranged and a general outline of the research's aim and methodology was mailed to them in advance of the meeting. At the first meeting with the HC Directors, the theme, the purpose, general outline, method, and details of this study were explained. Permission was then obtained to administer the questionnaire survey and to interview some of the staff in the HC Department. After identifying the respondents for the survey through random sampling, the next step was to arrange for the questionnaires to be distributed. For the in-depth interview, a meeting was arranged with the interviewees for some preliminary discussions. The final step was to conduct the survey and interviews on a mutually agreed date and time at the company's premise.

The survey questionnaires were distributed to the respondents through the HC Departments. From time to time, constant touch was kept with the HC Manager to ascertain that the filling up of the questionnaires was in constructive progress. One to two weeks were given to the respondents to complete the questionnaires. For the in-depth interviews, semi structured interviews were carried out in a private room and lasted for an hour to an hour and a half. However, based on the respondent's answer, other relevant questions were also asked. Tape recordings of each interview were made and later transcribed into written form. This was done repeatedly in an effort to retain the essence of what the individual was trying to say. The interview drafts were then sent back to each of the

interviewees to ensure the accuracy of the transcribed data. Notes were also taken during the interview and a summary of each interview was drafted. The interview drafts and the summarized responses to each question were tabulated and analyzed comparatively to identify key trends.

Instrumentation and data analysis

For the first study, the questionnaire was divided into two parts. The first part of the questionnaire consisted of single direct questions related to the profile of the company. The next part of the questionnaire was mainly to exploit information regarding recruitment, compensation and benefits, promotion, and human capital development. Nominal scale was used to measure this part of the questionnaire where two or multiple choices were provided for the respondent to choose the applicable answer. For some of the questions, open-ended responses were also required. For both the studies, semi structured interview questions were designed to collect data on recruitment, compensation, promotion, and human capital development practices of the organizations. In the second study, six single direct questions were used to tap demographic data where a range of response options was provided. However, respondents were asked to give the exact figures for questions related to age, age of entry, years of working experience and number of previous jobs held. To study the effect of human capital management practices on employee satisfaction, questions categorized into seven parts, namely Part A - G were measured using a five-point Likert scale. Respondents were required to signify their agreement or disagreement to each question by ticking the appropriate box to indicate their choice. Part A tapped the general satisfaction of the employees with the company. Parts B to G were items related to recruitment, compensation, benefits, rewards and recognition, promotion, and human capital development respectively.

Statistical procedures were employed to evaluate the data collected from the survey questionnaires. Descriptive statistics were used to describe the demographic profile of the respondents. Perceptual responses pertaining

to employees' satisfaction with the HCM practices of the companies were then evaluated. Data obtained from the interviews were analyzed on a comparative basis and tabulated to identify HCM practices that are similar to HCM practices in Japan and that are aligned with global trends. For each item, analysis was done comparatively for Japan and Malaysia in the first study and for the four companies in the second study. An overview of the responses is provided in a descriptive and comparative manner. Tables were drafted for comparison of the HCM practices among the companies in both the studies. In the second study, the number of HCM practices that are aligned with global trends for each company was then converted as a percentage of the total global HCM trends to understand the alignment rate of each component. The HCM practices on recruitment, compensation, promotion, and human capital development of all the companies were also discussed to understand the differences and similarities. After the analysis of the practices, the satisfaction of the employees with the practices of the organizations was elaborated. Finally, a comparative analysis was made to see if employees in foreign owned MNCs are more satisfied with each of the current HCM practices. The implications of the HCM practices were also discussed.

Expected Findings and Summary

As far as the first study is concerned, there is not a single model of Japanese HCM in the companies surveyed. However, some traits similar to Japanese HCM are visible in some of the companies surveyed, such as scouting for new graduates directly from the universities. Education and training too are moving towards the direction of Japanese management as can be seen by the emphasis in upgrading the level of education as well as training facilities available in the market. On-the-job training too takes a prominent role in most of the companies surveyed. Similarly, for those companies with American interest, there is no American model of HCM. Companies with a mix of local and foreign capital too do not show a single style of management, Japanese or otherwise. It can be said that Japanese style management and Western style management coexist in Malaysia and in the long run a Malaysian style management may result

— probably a mix of western (especially British style), oriental (Japanese, Korean and Taiwanese) and Malaysia's own indigenous style of management.

The main findings of this study show that HCM practices in Malaysia show a preference for experienced and professional employees during recruitment though internal promotion is given priority. For salary and promotion decisions, much emphasis is placed on skills and performance levels. Most of the organizations limit the weight placed on seniority. Though on-the-job training is widely used, all the organizations also appeared to have realized the importance of off-the-job training as well, so as to create a well-rounded employee who is equipped with a better balance of practical and intellectual skills. On-the-job training emphasizes on job rotation and off-the-job training techniques focus mainly on lecture and case study.

In a nutshell, companies in Malaysia have yet to fully adopt Japanese-style of HCM. This is consistent with findings by past research (Ahmad & Singh, 2001; Chin & Maniam, 2001; Hirano, 1991). Japanese subsidiaries in Malaysia adopt a combination of HCM practices; those of parent firms as well as the local British or American oriented HCM practices in Malaysia (Chew, 2005). While Japanese style HCM and Western style HCM can now coexist in Malaysia, in the long run, the strong possibility of the creation of a Malaysian style HCM exists (Chew, 2005). Emulating Japanese HCM practices in the four areas concerned may bring positive implications for Malaysia, but due to various constraints, it is not possible for Malaysian enterprises to simply import the Japanese system of doing things. However, by adapting the values of the traditional systems in management and incorporating certain aspects of Japanese and Western management in its modified form, a Malaysian style of HCM could evolve.

Since Japanese style of HCM was not much emulated despite the emphasis of the Look East Policy, what then are the current HCM

practices in Malaysia? The second study was carried out to understand the current HCM practices in Malaysia and their effects on employees' satisfaction. In today's business environment, the HC Department is facing tremendous pressure to deliver human capital functions that enhance people's performance. As employees' performance and employees' satisfaction are closely related, enhancing employees' satisfaction would to a certain extent improve the bottom line. The results showed that while companies have adopted some global trends in HCM, intensity varies from company to company. Though the practices are rather similar, the differences that exist have an impact on employees' satisfaction. However, one conclusion that can be drawn from the study is that foreign owned MNCs do not necessarily have better HCM practices even though these companies are more globalized in nature. Hence, employees' satisfaction in foreign owned MNCs is not necessarily higher than those in locally owned MNCs. Though all four companies are located in the same industrial area and are about the same size, the HCM practices of some of the companies are more attractive than others. Nevertheless, the morale of the respondents in all four companies is moderately high and respondents are generally satisfied with the HCM practices of their organizations. The general morale of the respondents is highest in Johan, followed by Gema, Hiro and finally EChem.

In all the four HCM practices that this part of the study sets out to explore, there is no clear trend as to employees' satisfaction with the practices. For example, employees in the locally owned MNC seem more satisfied with the recruitment practices while employees in foreign owned MNCs are more satisfied with the remuneration and reward practices of the company. None of the employees in the locally owned MNC (Johan) is very dissatisfied with promotion practices. As far as human capital development (HCD) is concerned, employees in Hiro seem least satisfied though Gema and EChem are rather committed in this. However, to improve service, increase productivity and focus human capital functions as a strategic business partner, it is becoming clearer that new

technology will play a significant role.

Satisfaction with the HCM practices also varies from company to company. The respondents in Gema seemed most satisfied among the four companies with the HCM practices explored in this study. Except for the promotion practices of the company, the respondents showed that they are most satisfied with the compensation and HCD practices as compared to the other three companies. However, the level of satisfaction of the respondents in Gema with the promotion practices is the lowest among the four companies. Respondents in Gema are most satisfied with the HCD practices, followed by the recruitment practices, compensation practices and then the promotion practices. Among the four companies, employees in Hiro seemed least satisfied with the HCM practices of the company. The company has the lowest mean for two variables, namely, HCD practices and compensation practices. The respondents are not too satisfied with the remuneration practices and rated lowly for benefits practices and rewards practices. As for the recruitment practices, respondents are slightly more satisfied than those in EChem. Respondents in EChem are also not as satisfied as the respondents in Johan with the HCM practices of the company.

Besides having the lowest morale among the four companies, the respondents in EChem are least satisfied with the recruitment practices as well. However, their satisfaction with the promotion practices ranked top, and the HCD practices and compensation practices ranked second in comparison with the other companies. Among the four variables, the respondents in EChem are most satisfied with the HCD practices, followed by promotion practices, recruitment practices and lastly compensation practices. In comparison with the other companies, employees in Johan are most satisfied with the recruitment practices of the company, second in their satisfaction with the promotion practices, and third in their satisfaction with the compensation and HCD practices. In sum, among the four companies, respondents in Gema seem most satisfied with the HCM practices of the company. Respondents in Hiro

seem least satisfied and respondents in Johan are more satisfied than respondents in EChem. Comparatively, respondents in all the companies seem most satisfied with the recruitment practices, followed by HCD practices, promotion practices and lastly compensation practices. On the whole, the respondents' level of satisfaction with the HCM practices and morale level is moderate.

Conclusion

The first study shows that despite Looking East for more than two decades, the adoption of Japanese HCM practices by the manufacturing companies in Malaysia is not significant. Rather, most of the companies practice a hybrid style of management incorporating western, oriental, and indigenous management techniques. However, in the long run, there is a strong possibility of the creation of a Malaysian style HCM. As for the second study, the findings show that generalization could not be made that foreign owned MNCs have adopted more global HCM practices and that employees in the foreign owned MNCs are more satisfied with the current HCM practices than the employees in the locally owned MNCs. No fixed pattern could be identified and the satisfaction level of the employees is very much dependent on what the company can offer regardless of ownership.

In a nutshell, HCM practices in Malaysia have transformed over the years though not very significantly. Due to the limited applicability of Japanese style HCM practices at the Malaysian workplace, the manufacturing companies in Malaysia have adopted not much of the Japanese practices. Also, due to cultural differences, the Japanese style of management though desirable in some aspects may not be suitable for the Malaysian workplace. However, this could be a blessing in disguise as Japanese corporations themselves are moving away from conventional Japanese HCM practices. Had Malaysian companies adopted conventional Japanese HCM practices as advocated by the LEP, Malaysian companies would have to tackle the same problems faced by Japanese corporations today. Companies would have to bear the burden

of paying big salaries to redundant senior management and restructuring would be inevitable. The LEP should be taken as an eye opener that gives an insight of how things could be learnt and adapted to suit the local environment. There is no necessity to emulate everything Japanese, but to create a Malaysian style of HCM by adapting the values of the traditional systems in management and incorporating certain aspects of Japanese and Western management in its modified form. In the era of globalization and IT explosion, Malaysian companies have advanced positively in adopting current global HCM practices. Contemporary HCM practices augment competitiveness and challenge Malaysian companies to venture out to take advantage of the spin off effects of globalization.

博士（経営学）学位申請論文審査報告書

申請者氏名：Hooi, Lai Wan

論文題名：*HUMAN CAPITAL MANAGEMENT PRACTICES*

IN MALAYSIA:

LOCAL & FOREIGN PERSPECTIVES

(PENERBIT UNIVERSITI TEKNOLOGI MALAYSIA PRESS,

Kuala Lumpur 2008, 338+9+26+4ページ)

学位申請の種類：乙号（論文博士，経営学）

審査報告書目次

1. 論文の意図
2. 論文の要旨
3. 概評
4. 結論

1. 論文の意図

本論文は、マレーシア政府のルックイースト政策が重視してきた日本型人的資本管理モデルのマレーシア企業への移転が果たして適合的になされたのか、また、グローバル化が進展する中で、欧米系多国籍企業を中心とする国際的な人的資本管理の影響はないのか、これらのことを中心に実態調査に基づいて検証しようとしたものである。

* 本論文の対象とする「人的資本管理 (human capital management)」は、わが国における労務管理、人事管理あるいは人的資源管理に相当するものである。

ルックイースト政策は、1981年の12月に導入されたが、その目的は、戦後の高度経済成長を成し遂げた日本および韓国に注目し、特にその成長の原動力と見られた労働倫理、社会意識、規律と経営スキルに学び、マレーシアの

産業化と近代化を促進することにあった。とりわけ日本企業の高い生産性とその提供する財・サービスの質の高さは、主に日本型人的資本管理に由来すると考えられ、日本型人的資本管理がマレーシア企業の模倣すべきモデルとしての役割を果たすことになった (pp.319-320)。

だが、果たしてロックイースト政策が提唱するようにマレーシア企業は日本型人的資本管理を模倣してきたのか、これを解明することが本論文の第1の目的である (p.11)。この問題を解明するために、まず、日本型人的資本管理モデルの特質が文献調査をもとに明らかにされる (第2章)。次いで、マレーシア企業 (在マレーシアの日系企業や欧米系企業を含む) 8社への聞き取り調査をもとに、日本型人的資本管理モデルの移転の可否が検証されることになる (第5章～第8章)。この移転の可否を検証するに当たり、本論文では、人的資本管理の中から企業の競争力に重要な影響を及ぼすと考えられる採用・報酬・昇進・人的資本開発の4つの主要領域に焦点を絞り (p.8)、それぞれが多面的かつ詳細に考察されることになる。

以上の検証の結果、在マレーシア日系企業も含むマレーシアの企業が日本型人的資本管理を導入していないとすれば、マレーシアの企業はいかなるタイプの人的資本管理を採用しているのだろうか。経済のグローバル化が進展している現在、むしろ人的資本管理におけるグローバルな動向がマレーシア企業の人的資本管理に影響を及ぼしているのではないか。これを解明することが本論文の第2の目的である (p.11)。この問題を解明するために、まず、採用、報酬、人的資本開発の3領域におけるグローバルな動向が文献調査をもとに明らかにされる (第4章)。次いで、マレーシア企業 (在マレーシアの日系企業や欧米系企業を含む) 4社への聞き取り調査をもとに、人的資本管理の4領域 (採用、報酬、昇進、人的資本開発) におけるグローバルな動向の影響の可否が詳細に検証されることになる (第5章～第8章)。

以上の2つの考察を踏まえ、マレーシア企業が現在採用している人的資本管理はいかなるタイプなのか、それは結論で示されることになる。

なお、本論文は、マレーシア企業に対し有用な実践的提言を行うことも、

副次的ではあるが意図している。この点に関しては、満足した労働者は組織を活性化させ、生産性と競争力の向上に役立つとの観点から、従業員に満足をもたらす人的資本管理施策が従業員へのアンケート調査をもとに探求されることになる。

2. 論文の要旨

まず本論文の全体に渡る構想を目次によって概観し、多少の趣旨紹介をすることとしたい。

- 第1章 人的資本管理への序論 序 マレーシアの職場で 本研究の目的
マレーシアにおける製造業研究の重要性 方法 本研究の意義 結
- 第2章 日本およびマレーシアにおける人的資本管理 序 日本の人的資本管理
日本の人的資本管理の移転可能性 マレーシアの人的資本管理
結
- 第3章 人的資本管理と従業員の満足 序 従業員の満足の規定要因 人的
資本管理が従業員の満足に及ぼす影響 結
- 第4章 人的資本管理におけるグローバルなトレンド 序 採用におけるグロー
バルなトレンド 報酬におけるグローバルなトレンド 人的資本開発に
おけるグローバルなトレンド 結
- 第5章 マレーシアの製造業における採用慣行 序 日本およびマレーシアに
おける採用慣行 マレーシアにおける採用慣行の現状 結
- 第6章 マレーシアの製造業における報酬慣行 序 日本およびマレーシアに
おける報酬慣行 マレーシアにおける報酬慣行の現状 結
- 第7章 マレーシアの製造業における昇進慣行 序 日本およびマレーシアに
おける昇進慣行 マレーシアにおける昇進慣行の現状 結
- 第8章 マレーシアの製造業における人的資本開発慣行 序 日本およびマレー
シアにおける人的資本開発慣行 マレーシアにおける人的資本開発の現状
結

第9章	結論と提言	序	検討および結論	マレーシアにおける人的資本管理の将来	人的資本管理に関する政府の今後の政策	提言	今後の研究のための提言	結
付録	文献一覧	索引						

「第1章 人的資本管理への序論」では、本論文への導入部分として、本論文の目的、研究方法および意義が述べられる。

まず、本論文の目的として、(1) マレーシアの企業は、ルックイースト政策が提唱したように日本型人的資本管理を模倣してきたのか否かを分析すること、(2) マレーシアにおける製造業の多国籍企業の人的資本管理の現状について、グローバルな人的資本管理のトレンドの影響を受けているのか否かを分析すること、(3) 外資系多国籍企業の人的資本管理は、マレーシアのローカル企業のそれよりもグローバルなトレンドの影響をより強く受けているのか否かを分析すること、(4) 現在導入されている人的資本管理が従業員の満足に及ぼす効果を分析すること、これらの4つが示される (p.11)。

また、本論文における実証研究の分析対象となる12社について、その資本構成や所属産業部門などが説明される。

最後に、本論文の意義として、日本型人的資本管理のマレーシアへの移転可能性が明らかになり、ひいてはその海外移転の可能性についての示唆が得られること、また、ルックイースト政策を継続すべきか否かについての適切な提言も示すことができること、さらに、能率に好影響を及ぼす従業員の満足度の高い人的資本管理施策が明らかになり、マレーシア企業の競争力と従業員の満足度を共に高める人的資本管理のあり方についての示唆が得られること、を挙げている (pp.17-18)。

「第2章 日本およびマレーシアにおける人的資本管理」では、文献調査に基づいて、日本およびマレーシア企業の人的資本管理の特質を明らかにしている。

まず、ルックイースト政策が模倣すべきモデルとした伝統的な日本型人的

資本管理について、終身雇用と年功賃金を取り上げその特質を示している (pp.20-24)。次いで、経済のグローバル化の進展や1990年代の長期不況の影響の下で、伝統的な日本型人的資本管理が変化しつつある点に着目し、その変化の動向を概観している (pp.26-30)。さらに、日本型人的資本管理の海外への移転可能性に関して、ドーア (Dore, R.) の『イギリスの工場・日本の工場』を始めとする諸説を検討している (pp.31-36)。最後に、マレーシアの人的資本管理の特質を採用、報酬、昇進、人的資本開発の諸側面に関して概観し、当初は、植民地時代の影響からイギリスの色彩が強かったものの、近年は変化が見られることを示している (pp.36-43)。

「第3章 人的資本管理と従業員の満足」では、文献調査をもとに、人的資本管理の諸施策が従業員の満足に及ぼす影響について考察している。満足した労働者は組織を活性化させ、生産性と競争力の向上に役立つことから、従業員に満足をもたらす人的資本管理施策は何かを理解する必要性を強調している (p.55)。

「第4章 人的資本管理におけるグローバルなトレンド」では、文献調査をもとに、採用、報酬、人的資本開発の3領域におけるグローバルな動向を詳細に明らかにしている。

第5章から第8章までの4つの章では、12社への聞き取り調査やアンケート調査をもとに、採用、報酬、昇進、人的資本開発の各領域において、第1章で設定された本論文の研究目的に沿った分析と検証が行われる。

「第5章 マレーシアの製造業における採用慣行」では、まず、在マレーシアの日系企業やアメリカ系企業、日本とマレーシアの合弁企業、マレーシアのローカル企業など8社に対する聞き取り調査をもとに、採用管理の領域において、ルックイースト政策が推奨した日本型人的資本管理が移転しているか否かを採用政策、採用チャンネル、採用基準などの十数項目に渡って詳細に検証し (pp.99-115)、新規学卒者の定期採用と採用後の従業員教育を重視するなどの点で特徴的な日本型の採用管理は、経験者の採用を重視し、従業員の教育訓練には注力しないマレーシア企業にはほとんど採用されていない

と結論づけている (p.145)。

次いで、在マレーシアの日系企業やヨーロッパ系企業ならびにマレーシアのローカル企業など4社に対する聞き取り調査をもとに、マレーシアの企業が採用管理に関してグローバルなトレンドの影響を受けているか否かを労働力計画の導入、内部異動の重視など十数項目に渡って詳細に検証し、企業により影響度は異なるものの、平均して4割程度の項目を採用していることが示されている (pp.119-129)。

また、4社の従業員に対するアンケート調査をもとに、4社が導入している採用管理の諸施策に対する従業員の満足度を分析している (pp.129-136)。

「第6章 マレーシアの製造業における報酬慣行」では、まず、8社に対する聞き取り調査をもとに、報酬管理の領域において、日本型人的資本管理が移転しているか否かを給与の決定基準、給与の支払方法、昇給の決定基準など十数項目に渡って詳細に検証し (pp.151-169)、給与の決定基準として年齢や勤続年数を重視するなどの点で特徴的な日本型の報酬管理を、給与の決定に際して技能や業績水準をはるかに重視するマレーシア企業は模倣してこなかったと結論づけている (p.217)。また、報酬制度に関しては、近年、日本企業自体が成果主義的傾向を強めつつあり、伝統的な日本型報酬管理を模倣することは疑問ですらあると述べている (p.217)。

次いで、4社に対する聞き取り調査をもとに、マレーシアの企業が報酬管理に関してグローバルなトレンドの影響を受けているか否かを賃金の成果主義化、ボーナス制度など二十数項目に渡って詳細に検証し (pp.172-195)、全体的にはグローバルなトレンドを取り入れる動きは弱いものの、健康保険などの福利公正施策に関してはグローバルなトレンドに合致し、その採用率が高いと結論づけている (p.218)。

また、従業員へのアンケート調査をもとに、4社が導入している報酬管理の諸施策に対する従業員の満足度を分析し (pp.196-202)、マレーシアではほとんど採用されていない企業年金を取り入れているローカル企業の従業員の満足度が4社中2位と高いことなどを指摘している (p.219)。

「第7章 マレーシアの製造業における昇進慣行」では、まず、8社に対する聞き取り調査をもとに、昇進管理の領域において、日本型人的資本管理が移転しているか否かを昇進政策、昇進基準など数項目に渡って検証し (pp.223-231)、年功を重視した遅い昇進などの点で特徴的な日本型の昇進管理は、もっと早い昇進を期待しているマレーシアの従業員には受容されないことなどから、マレーシア企業はこれを採用してこなかったと結論づけている (p.256)。ただ、日本企業も、近年、昇進基準に関して業績を重視するように変化してきており、この点で、マレーシア企業との共通性が生まれている (pp.256-257)。それゆえ、伝統的な日本型昇進管理を模倣すべきとするルックイースト政策を継続する必要性は果たしてあるのか、との疑問を呈している (p.256)。

次いで、4社に対する聞き取り調査をもとに、マレーシア企業の昇進管理の現状が10項目に渡って詳しく示されている (pp.236-247)。

また、従業員へのアンケート調査をもとに、昇進管理の諸施策に対する従業員の満足度を分析し (pp.247-250)、4社の中で唯一シニオリティを昇進基準として重視するマレーシアのローカル企業の従業員の満足度が4社中2位と高いことなどを指摘している (pp.257-258)。

「第8章 マレーシアの製造業における人的資本開発慣行」では、まず、8社に対する聞き取り調査をもとに、人的資本開発の領域において、日本型人的資本管理が移転しているか否かを人的資本開発プログラムの特徴、訓練プログラムのタイプ、ジョブ・ローテーションなど数項目に渡って検証し (pp.262-276)、新規学卒者に対し、その採用後に、OJTやジョブ・ローテーションなどの様々な形態の訓練を施すなどの特徴をもつ日本型の人的資本開発は、経験者の採用を優先するマレーシア企業はこれを採用してこなかったと結論づけている (p.308)。

次いで、4社に対する聞き取り調査をもとに、マレーシアの企業が人的資本開発に関してグローバルなトレンドの影響を受けているか否かを訓練需要の分析、eラーニングなど十数項目に渡って詳細に検証し (pp.279-288)、

とりわけヨーロッパ系の2社がグローバルなトレンドを積極的に取り入れているのに対し、100%日本資本の日系企業は親会社の人的資本開発も模倣しておらず、グローバルなトレンドの採用に最も消極的であると指摘している(pp.309-310)。

「第9章 結論と提言」では、以上の考察から得られた結論をまとめ、これに加えてマレーシア企業に対する提言を述べ、今後の研究課題を示している。

まず、結論として、20年以上に渡ってルックイースト政策をとってきたにもかかわらず、マレーシアにおける製造業の諸企業は日本型人的資本管理をほとんど模倣せず、採用してこなかったと述べている(p.337)。むしろ、欧米的・国際的な人的資本管理の動向がかなりの影響を及ぼしており、これらとアジア式ならびにマレーシア式を組み合わせたハイブリッド型になっている。そして、将来的には、イギリス式、(日本、韓国および台湾の)アジア式、マレーシア式を組み合わせた独自のマレーシア型の人的資本管理が生み出されるであろうし、生み出すべきであるとしている(p.312, pp.337-338)。

また、伝統的な日本型人的資本管理を模倣すべきとするルックイースト政策に関しては、文化の異なるマレーシアの職場が日本型人的資本管理を受け入れることは困難であり、しかも、近年、日本型人的資本管理自体がグローバルなトレンドに沿うような変化も見られることから、今後もこれを継続する必要性はないとしている(p.320)。

最後に、本論文の考察を踏まえ、マレーシア企業に対し、成果主義的報酬制度の徹底など11項目に渡る提言を示すとともに、今後の研究課題も提示している。

3. 概 評

本論文は、マレーシア企業の人的資本管理を2つの視点から、すなわち、第1に、ルックイースト政策が重視した日本型人的資本管理を模倣しているのか否か、第2に、人的資本管理のグローバルな動向の影響を受けているの

か否か、これらの2つの視点から実証的に考察した好論文である。

日本的経営の海外移転のように、2国間の経営制度の移転に関しては多くの研究が存在するものの、経営制度の移転をグローバルな視点も加えて考察している点は、既存研究にはあまり見られない本論文の特徴の1つと言える。

問題意識、課題設定は明確であり、それに対してブレることなく、理論と実態調査の両面から、一貫してテーマを追求している点でも優れている。

マレーシア企業（在マレーシアの日系企業や欧米系企業を含む）12社を対象とした実態調査に関しては、人的資本管理の主要な4領域（採用、報酬、昇進、人的資本開発）に焦点を当て、各領域について数項目から十数項目に渡る非常に詳細な比較考察がなされており、この点も高く評価することができる。

また、実態調査の前提となる理論的基礎研究も、当該分野の研究に不可欠な基本的文献を含む300余に上る文献サーヴェイをもとにしっかりなされており、人的資本管理の基礎理論、日本およびマレーシアの人的資本管理、英・米・独・豪などの人的資本管理の国際的動向などが、簡潔に、しかも要領よく纏められている。

他方、多くの興味深い調査結果が示されてはいるものの、調査サンプルが12社と少なく、得られた調査結果をどこまで一般化できるのか、この点で疑問がなくてはならない。

とはいえ、日本的経営の海外への移転可能性に関しては、これまでわが国においては、欧米を始め、中国や東南アジア諸国、さらには旧東欧諸国への移転など、少なくない研究蓄積が存在するものの、人的資本管理に焦点を絞り、マレーシアへのその移転可能性を、本論文のように丹念かつ詳細に検討した研究はこれまでの所あまりなく、この点で、本論文はわが国におけるこの分野の研究に大いに寄与するものと評価することができる。

4. 結 論

以上のように Hooi, Lai Wan 氏の本論文は、氏が経営学の分野において研究者として自立して研究活動を行うに必要な高度の研究能力およびその基礎となる豊かな学識を有しているものと判断できる。したがって本論文は博士（経営学）の学位論文に十分値するものと評価することができる。

また、桃山学院大学学位規程第7条に定める「(博士後期)課程を修了した者と同等以上の学力を有することを確認された者」という学力確認規定のうち外国語に関しては、同規程第30条（「研究科委員会が業績、経歴等により学力の確認をし得ると認めるときは、これを全部または一部免除することができる」）および「経営学研究科博士学位論文審査に関する運営内規」10の2)により、本論文は正確な英語で書かれており、外国語能力は論文自体によって十分であると認定でき、これをもって試問に代えた。

論文に関する口頭試験は2009（平成21）年12月2日（水）に審査委員全員出席のもとにおこなったが、上記判断と齟齬するところはないことを確認した。

以上の結果、学位申請者 Hooi, Lai Wan 氏は博士（経営学）の学位を授与されるのに十分な資格があるものと認める。

2010年2月17日

審査委員（主査） 経営学部教授 正 亀 芳 造

審査委員（副査） 経営学部教授 片 岡 信 之

審査委員（副査） 経営学部教授 三 宅 亨

審査委員（副査） 経営学部教授 村 上 伸 一